

San Carlos Apache Federally Recognized Tribe Extension Program Ripple Effects Mapping Findings

The Indian Land Tenure Foundation (ILTF) engaged in a joint collaboration with an evaluation team and the Western Extension Risk Management Education Center to measure the long-term impacts of the Federally Recognized Tribal Extension Program (FRTEP) serving the San Carlos Apache Tribe. In order to collect this information, the evaluation team used a tool called Ripple Effects Mapping (REM). REM is a storytelling technique that is used to collect stories and experiences from community members. The results at the completion of a Ripple Effects Mapping included both a visual map and a set of narratives that were subsequently analyzed.

The data from 31 FRTEP programs was summarized into a final report – *“Mapping FRTEP Impacts in Indian Country”* and published in March 2022 for the purpose of demonstrating the collective value of the programs. This report can be found [Measuring FRTEP’s success - Tribal Extension](#).

In February 2020, a Ripple Effects Mapping event was held with San Carlos Apache Tribal members and others in the community who benefited from FRTEP programs or were aware of the impact of this programming. Those participating in the event may have included farmers/ranchers, community members including agency and/or Tribal leadership, high school students, 4-H members, and others.

During the session, participants had the opportunity to tell us stories about how they have benefited from having FRTEP in their community. A facilitator led the conversation, asking each Tribal and/or community member to share their story one at a time. Questions participants were asked to consider included:

1. *Tell us a story about how one of these programs has had an impact on your Tribal community.*
2. *Are you or your family doing anything differently as a result of these programs?*
3. *What has been a personal benefit to you or your family because of these programs?*
4. *What has been the most helpful part of these programs for you, your family, or your Tribal community?*

As individuals spoke, their stories were both recorded and mapped into digital mapping software in order to visually display the impact. No individual’s names are included in this data set or the final report mentioned above. Following the REM, those stories were analyzed using the FRTEP priority program areas to determine the ways in which the FRTEP has impacted the Tribe and surrounding community.

This report includes all of the stories collected from the San Carlos Apache Tribe.

- Page 2 shows examples of ways you can use this information.
- Page 3 summarizes in themes and subthemes the ways in which the FRTEP program and you as the FRTEP educator/agent had impact in your Tribal community.
- Pages 4-8 includes these themes and all of the stories collected from your REM event.
- Page 9 is an image of the full REM Map, which is also attached as a PDF for reprinting. Additionally, a laminated poster of your REM MAP is being mailed to you, to share with community members, Tribal leaders and others vested in your programs.

If you would like to have an opportunity to discuss in further detail and/or have questions, we can set up a Zoom meeting with one of the Ripple Effects Mapping team members.

Rebecca Sero, r.sero@outlook.com;
Debra Hansen, debra.ann.hansen@gmail.com; and
JoAnn Warner, warnerj@wsu.edu

How you can use your Ripple Effects Mapping data:

Storytelling is a powerful technique that can be used in many different ways. Your stories from REM helped us understand the impacts and value of FRTEP that can be shared with funders, Tribal members and leadership. More than numbers, stories can reveal needs, achievements and emotional real-life impacts. Your story examples can be used multiple ways to elevate the importance of the work that you are doing and to demonstrate the collective impact that it is having in your community

Here are three ways you can use the two edited story examples (below) while also utilizing the report's themes and subthemes to demonstrate the impacts this program is having:

Within the Community

- Stories can be shared or incorporated into community celebrations and/or events.
- Communicated to your Advisory Committee to help build capacity for future programming.

In Reports

- Prepared reports Tribal Council members and other community leaders with story examples, themes and subthemes that show how FRTEP is working to accomplish the priority areas established by the Tribal Advisory Council; and which relay the benefits, impacts and other indicators of success as a result of FRTEP.
- Prepared reports for your 1862 Land Grant University or your 1994 Tribal College or University leadership with story examples embedded and that include the themes and sub themes from each of the program's priority areas. Highlight how the Ripple Effects Mapping session empowered community members to share their stories and the benefits inherent in discovering the successes brought about by the program.

In Grant Applications

- Having a solid evaluation plan is critical to writing a successful grant application. Including outcomes from the Ripple Effects Mapping demonstrates the long-lasting impacts of FRTEP and uses a culturally appropriate approach to do so.

In summary, the stories and data that you have collected through the Ripple Mapping process can be used many different ways to communicate your successes and to elevate your program not only at the community level – but also to your stakeholder partners, collaborators and other individuals, organizations and entities, for the purpose of strengthening and building the capacity of FRTEP.

Themes and Subthemes

For the San Carlos Apache Tribe and community, the impacts, effects, and benefits could all be found within the following program priority areas and subthemes listed here. On pages 4-8, you will see the same priority areas, subthemes with individual stories collected directly from the transcript.

1. American Indian Cultural and Linguistic Preservation

- Engaging Tribal Members in Tribal Traditions
- Engaging Youth in Tribal Traditions

2. Indian Community Development Around Economic and Workforce Enhancement

- Strengthening Communities

3. Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management

- Support for Ranchers

4. Indigenous Food Systems for Food Security, Food Safety and Obesity Reduction

- Adult Involvement
- Traditional foods
- Youth Involvement

5. Tribal Youth and 4-H

- Gardening & Nutrition
- Life skills

Overall

- Connections and Partnerships
 - Responsive to Community Needs
-

Themes, Subthemes and Stories

Theme	Sub-Theme	Statement
American Indian Cultural and Linguistic Preservation	Engaging Tribal Members in Tribal Traditions	An exciting part of that same topic being discussed as a ripple effect is, you hear it a lot, going back to the old ways that were lost for a little while maybe. Through the life center things are being brought back, at least to certain people, and that's part of the discussion is that elders did it this way and now we're relearning that.
American Indian Cultural and Linguistic Preservation	Engaging Youth in Tribal Traditions	There's definitely a big gap. You see that bridge gap, but now it's definitely bridging because as far as sugar cane. Kids don't know what sugar cane is but the older generation, "Oh, I remember that. I used to throw it in the freezer and pop that open." Then they want to share that with their grandkids and so on, and so on, and teach them. It's just that taste that they feel the power of food.
American Indian Cultural and Linguistic Preservation	Engaging Tribal Members in Tribal Traditions	Then, stews, there's different ways to harvest your food. Again, it goes back to maybe family recipes and so on and so on. This year, I also work with the local botanist here and [agent]. We're going to do more of a traditional garden this year. Instead of planting in rows, we're going to plant in mounds.
American Indian Cultural and Linguistic Preservation	Engaging Youth in Tribal Traditions	That's really important because here on the reservation, they know to start educating young. Apache language, there's a large gap between elders to children starting Head Start, about four years, when [agent] did the Apache language program, dual emersion. Now those kids are speaking Apache but there's a whole gap between younger children to older adults, elders especially. A lot of my students didn't speak a lick of Apache so starting young is really important. For them to be learning about half their plate being fruits and vegetables, for them to be learning about the food growing cycle and how long it takes, and recycling leaves. All those things, yes, through the [agent] and the Head Start program. [The agent] was going in and doing it.
Indian Community Development Around Economic and Workforce Enhancement	Strengthening Communities	We've done team support group but also life skills in general programs. We work educational workshops. There's a skateboard outreach. It's become these other things but the hub is on the tree farm. Yes, what I'm trying to say is with that kind of DNA, that agricultural component, without that partnership with the extension agency. Without [the agent], that wouldn't exist. From there, yes, we partnered with University of Arizona, Engineers Without Borders. That turned into a partnership with a grant writing agency.

Theme	Sub-Theme	Statement
Indian Community Development Around Economic and Workforce Enhancement	Strengthening Communities	Whether you like it or not. She's like, "Hey, you guys got money from this grant." Like what grant? We're learning. We're learning along the way, yes. These are dominoes, because of that partnership, NDC has won three USDA grants. We are five years old. Before that, I was writing grants for us and getting \$200 and \$300. It was nothing on this level at all. The most recent one, we were the first Arizona nonprofit to have won this USDA grant. Washington knows who we are now. Again, that trickles back to this [University] Extension relationship.
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for Ranchers	There was a series of years where horsemanship workshops were really emphasized. Professional horseshoers were used to do some of those workshops. Some of them we took out to the ranches to try to get the cowboy out there attend a little bit. One year later, I'm seeing a change in shoeing skills. Sometimes it's just like well, they always told us to shoe our horses, but nobody ever knows how.
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for Ranchers	Another ripple effect has been really working with the restocking programs, spending economic development money back into the livestock industry. Some of the science behind that with University employees, we're doing genetic improvement, artificial insemination. The actual restocking plans themselves had a lot [University] review that gave merit to get funding, to get the tribe to invest several million dollars into some of the process. This is still ongoing. Some of the technical specialists behind it were University employees, somewhat through Cooperative Extension, somewhat through just the University agreement with the Tribe.
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for Ranchers	The University's technical assistance has been strongly there. They did a lot of their research projects there through the 50s, 60s, 70s, and 80s. That's kind of diminished somewhat for a variety of reasons but I want to recognize that that is the long-standing ripple effect of the Cooperative Extension.
Indian Farmer and Rancher Productivity and Management	Support for Ranchers	[The agent] is doing some horse and cattle workshops.
Indigenous Food Systems for Food Security, Food Safety and Obesity Reduction	Adult involvement	[Rehabilitation facility] is a collaboration with both the adult inmates [and juveniles]. The reason I say that is because the adults, they go out there and they're the ones that prepare the garden for them before they start their garden. They're the ones that clean out and get it ready for them. They also learn something as well. They actually like being out there. They just like being outside. We've also shared what they

Theme	Sub-Theme	Statement
		grow there. They'll harvest it and then we'll use it in our own kitchen. They'll make the dishes there for them.
Indigenous Food Systems for Food Security, Food Safety and Obesity Reduction	Traditional foods	<p>The tree farm property, I work out there alongside NDC. I'm the vice president. With [the agent], the garden definitely has, even just for myself, has bettered my health. Probably this past year, 2019, a little bit late spring, my mother got hit with type 2. She didn't know what was going on with her, but she started losing [her hair]. For a woman, your hair is everything. I didn't know what was going on with her. She had her own battle. Being that I was working in the garden alongside [the agent] growing these traditional foods such as the giant sugar cane, along with zucchinis and other things, I started to bring that home. Another one of my good mentors, elders, got hit with type 2 as well. That really opened up my eyes to diabetes. It hits when it's a family member.</p>
Indigenous Food Systems for Food Security, Food Safety and Obesity Reduction	Youth involvement	<p>We work at the facility. We are in the junior master garden program, juveniles, ages 10 to 17. [The agent] comes every Friday and teaches our students garden skills in the classroom. Not only that, he also teaches them health and nutrition. This program is part of our rehabilitation program which is a support system to our academics. When he has finished teaching our kids garden skills in the classroom, he brings them out to the garden. This is a very exciting activity for all of our students because they are just in the detention center, not enjoying the sun. Every Friday morning, they look forward to meeting [the agent] in the garden and they do hands-on activities there. They apply whatever they've learned in the classroom... They get to go out and experience, and get their fingers dirty? Prior to Friday, they ask if [the agent] is coming to our class. We say "yes." Friday morning, they just keep asking if they're going out to the garden. They're so excited, I think not only because they will get to go out and enjoy the sun but also get to do something different from the everyday routine that they have in our education center because they have computer-based instruction. Basically, that's what they get to do for five-and-a-half hours a day. Doing something else is a treat to them. You hear them say things like "I want to start a garden."</p>
Indigenous Food Systems for Food Security, Food Safety and Obesity Reduction	Youth involvement	<p>One time we even had an experience of going to the older adult center. Our student brought their harvest and shared with the older adult community. They expressed happiness over sharing the blessings with the older adults. They said they've never had that kind of joy before and made them really happy to see how the older adults were excited with</p>

Theme	Sub-Theme	Statement
		the produce that they have received. Some of the older adults saw the Apache squash, they almost stared at their own elbows. They were excited because they hadn't seen Apache squash like that in a long time. Apache squash, watermelon, tomatoes. The traditional one they were planting quite often is Apache giant squash and Apache red sugar cane.
Indigenous Food Systems for Food Security, Food Safety and Obesity Reduction	Youth involvement	They love it when we put their harvest in the local fairs. We participate in the Gila County Fair almost every year. We have about 10 different kinds of produce or fruits and vegetables, and all of them win. When we get all the ribbons, students are excited. They show off their ribbons for picture taking.
Indigenous Food Systems for Food Security, Food Safety and Obesity Reduction	Youth involvement	A lot of the kids in the area, they don't really have any other activities during [the summer]. They'll just come from around their block and just come and join the summer camp. Just the summer camp in itself fills a great need for the youth. There isn't much... to offer. [The agent] will come in. He'll start a garden there. He teaches on food and nutrition and a healthy lifestyle, and gardening practices, of course. The kids are very enthusiastic about that, growing something from seed to see it actually grow and they learn that you can grow your own food. How beneficial that is to your own personal health. It also, on the rehabilitation side of things, there's a lot of trauma within the communities so with gardening and growing something and learning those skills really helps. There's some mental health over all that, wellness... There's a lot of peace you get from just gardening and being out there working with your hands.
Indigenous Food Systems for Food Security, Food Safety and Obesity Reduction	Youth involvement	I would just hear from the Head Start director. We love [the agent]. Oh, yes, the kids just love getting their hands in the dirt and working with worms, and learning about agriculture, and derivatively about nutrition. I felt like I was a friend to a rock star.
Tribal Youth and 4-H	Gardening and nutrition	Two [youth] that were involved in the 4H program, just seeing them learn and get involved after they were done with the 4H program. They now are adults and still... going in that direction for their careers and schools, colleges. They're still doing the outreach in community. Mostly in the area of bringing agriculture, plants. Because the 4-H program that they were involved in was gardening. The gardening was mostly on growing Apache Native plants. Preserving and trying to conserve, soil, water, air, all in that area.
Tribal Youth and 4-H	Life skills	4-H helped [the youth] grow... because they had to present. They had to grow their own crops. They had to learn how to

Theme	Sub-Theme	Statement
		interview at the county fair. They were rewarded by receiving ribbons. One got the grand champion. They practiced. They practiced on doing this. They practiced on what they would do and what they would present, and what they would enter at the fair. We practiced interviewing skills. We all did. All the kids did. I think that was their reward, so they just kept going. They enjoyed it.
Overall	Connections and partnerships	It's the extension program that's brought all these people together, all these programs together, each one of us, and each one of us had that unique or that special knowledge or education or background to be able to participate and bring that to this. [The agent], this program brought us all together.
Overall	Connections and partnerships	We're all working together collectively, and there's more connections there than are discovered yet. There's connections there that can be improved and made stronger. I think this is just the beginning.
Overall	Responsive to community needs	[The] Extension program is great, flexible to the needs of the community. One day I asked [the agent] if he would join me... and he said, "No, I can't. I got to teach archery." I'm like, "What do you mean teach archery? You actually... teach archery?" He learned archery and then started an archery program because there was a need in the community. Again, he doesn't talk a lot about it. He just does it because it's something that's needed. His kids wanted to learn archery. It's a traditional thing for a lot of people, and so [the agent] learned it and is teaching it now. Just that flexibility to even if he doesn't know how to do it, he learns it and then he implements it.
Overall	Responsive to community needs	[The agent] doesn't talk a lot. He just does the work. You can just count on him for all of this. He just shows up, teaches, does the work, and does so much for the community.
Overall	Responsive to Community Needs	[Agent] is our consultant, our expert. He's the boots on the ground doing archery, equine, gardening, nutrition, all these things that directly work with youth. Because all the rest of us up until now, maybe a month ago, have full time jobs aren't able to do that much.
Overall	Responsive to community needs	I'm talking about [the agent] but extension program is great, flexible to the needs of the community

